NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION (LAW DIVISION)

MANAV ADHIKAR BHAWAN, BLOCK-C, G.P.O. COMPLEX, INA, NEW DELIH-110023

Dated 09/07/2015

Case No. 29/11/2/2010-AD/DB-J

Shri SUHAS CHAKMA, DIRECTOR, NCPT C-3/441-C, JANAKPURI, NEW DELHI – 110 058. 1 6 JUL 2015

Sir/Madam,

With reference to your complaint dated 29/01/2010, I am directed to say that the matter was considered by the Commission on 27/05/2015. The Commission has made the following directions.

LINKED WITH CASE NO.28/11/2/2010-FCD

In this matter, the Commission vide its proceedings dated 1st January, 2014, recommended to the Government of Kerala to pay a sum of Rs. 1.00 lakh to the NOK of Komath Nazar for his death due to absence of care on the part of police personnel on duty while keeping him in police custody.

Now, a communication dated 11.7.2014 has been received by the Commission from the Additional Chief Secretary, Government of Kerala stating—that Rs.one lakh as compensation has been paid to the NOK of the deceased Komath Nazar, S/o Salim. Proof of payment has also been enclosed therewith.

Since the recommendation of the Commission has been complied with, the case is closed.

This is for your information.

Yours faithfully,

DEPUTY REGISTRAR(LAW)

COPY TO:

SMT. KADEEJA W/O KOMATH NAZAR JASEELA MANZIL, KETTINAKAM PO MUZHUPPILANGAD, KANNUR, KERALA.

HOME COMPLAINTS GALLERY CONTACT US

National Human Rights Commission New Delhi, India

Case Details of File Number: 28/11/2/2010-PCD

Dlary Number 9574

Name of the Complainant SUPERINTENDENT OF POLICE

Address

KANNUR, KERALA

Name of the Victim KOMATH NAZAR S/O SALIM

Address JASEELA MANZIL, KETTINAKKAM, MUZHAPPILAGAD, (EDAKKAD POLICÉ STATION LIMÍTS)

KANNUR, KERALA

Place of Incident THALASSERY PS.

KANNUR, KERALA

Date of Incident 1/25/2010

Komat Nazar, aged 38 years committed suicide in the lockup attached to P S. Thalassery, District Kannur on 25 1,2010 by hanging himself with a lungi from the grill of the lockup. The Information of his death was given to the Commission by SP, Kannur, A complaint was also received from Shri Suhas Chakma, Director, National Campaign for Prevention of Torture alleging that Komath Nazar had died due to police torture. Finding prima facio that the police guards posted at the police station were negligent, the Commission issued a show cause notice u/s 18 of the Protection of Human Rights Act.

1993 to the Gov. of Kerala. In response to the show cause notice, the State Government has submitted in its

communication dated 30 6.2011 that the police had given all possible care to Komath Nazar and his co-accused while they were in custody. It is also stated that Komath Nazar had made an attempt to commit suicide on an earlier occasion in the lockup of Panagad Police Station, Ernakulam. As regards monetary relief, the State Government has not made any

Direction issued by the Commission comment in its communication. We find no ment in the plea of the State Government. It has been stated that

Cr.No.133/2010 was registered at P.S. Thalassery after the suicide. The case was investigated by CB CID. The investigation report of CB CID is on the record. The investigating agency has stated in the concluding part of its report that "there was absence of due care on the part of police personnel on duty white keeping the deceased in police custody." Since the police has been indicted of negligence in the investigation report of CB CID, we see no reason as to why the State Government should not be held vicanously liable for the death of Komath Nazar. Considering all circumstances, we recommend to the Government of Kerala to pay a sum of Rs one lakh as monetary relief to the next of kin of deceased Komath Nazar. Chief Secretary, Govt. of Kerala shall submit the compliance report with proof of payment within eight

eks.

Action Taken Relief granted [Compensation, Disciplinary & Prosecution) (Dated 1/1/2014)

Status on 5/21/2014 Compliance of the Commission's recommendation by the concerned authority is awaited.

Note: For further details kindly contact National Human Rights Commission, Manav Adhikar Bhawan Block-C, GPO Complex, INA, New Delhi - 110023

Tel.No. 24651330 Fax No. 24651329 E-Mail: covdnhrc[at]nic[dot]in, ionhrc[at]nic[dot]in

<u>नोटः</u> अन्य जानकारी हेतु कृपया संपर्क करे राष्ट्रीय मानव अधिकार आयोग, मानव अधिकार भवेन, बेलोंक-सी, जी.पी.औ. कम्प्लेक्स, आई.एन.ए., नई दिल्ली - 110023,

फोन नं. 24651330 फैक्स नं. 24651329 ई-मेल : covdnhrc[at]nic[dot]in, ionhrc[at]nic[dot]in

Disclaimer: Neither NHRC nor NIC is responsible for any inadvertent error that may have crept in the information being published on NET. <u>अस्यीकरण</u>ः तेर पर वकाधित सूचना में, भनजाने में हुई किसी भी भावती के विए न तो एन.एच.आर.सी. त ही एन.आई.सी. जिस्मेदार है।

http://nhrc.nic.in/display.asp

National Human Rights Commission New Delhi, India

Case Details of File Number: 29/11/2/2010-AD

Diary Number

11636

Name of the Complainant

SUHAS CHAKMA, DIRECTOR

Address

NATIONAL CAMPAIGN FOR PREVENTION OF TORTURE, C-3/441-C, JANAKPURI,

WEST DELHI, DELHI

Name of the Victim

KOMATH VEETIL NAZAR S/O SALEEM

Address

JASEELA MANZIL, MUZHAPPILANGAD, PS-THALASSERY

KANNUR, KERALA

Place of Incident

PS-THALASŞERY

Date of Incident

KANNUR, KERALA 1/25/2010

Direction issued by the Commission

Sh Suhas Chakma, Director, National Campaign for Prevention of Torture, New Delhi in a complaint dated 29.1.2010 stated that on 25.1.2010 Mr Komath Veetil Nazar died in Custody of Thalassery Police Station in Kannur District of Kerala. The sustain was picked up by Police in a cheating case and found dead in the totals of the police station same day. Police

victim was picked up by Police in a cheating case and found dead in the toilets of the police station same day. Police claimed that the victim committed suicide whereas the resident of the area alleged that victim died due to torture. The complainant has requested for Intervention of the Commission to direct the state government to conduct a judicial inquiry into

the incident, submitting the Post Mortem Report of the deceased as per guidelines of the Commission, action against the erring police officials and awarding interim compensation to NOK of the deceased Registry has reported that there is one

more case on the same incident (case No. 28/11/2/2010 PCD). Link up with above case.

Action Taken

Additional Information Called for (Dated 2/19/2010)

Status on 9/21/2012

the action from a profunctionally as available

Note: For twitter details kindly contact Material Human Rights Commission, Copernicus Marg, New Delbi, PIN 110001 Tel,No. 23385868 Fax No. 23384863 E-Mail, covidning@hob.njc,(in

Distribution: MHRC on MIC in responsible for any mad-entent error that may have creat in the Complaint Internation being published on NET. The Complaint Internation on net is for immediate inferience on the Complaint and

HOME COMPLAINTS GALLERY CONTACT US

National Human Rights Commission New Delhi, India

Case Details of File Number: 28/11/2/2010-PCD

Diary Number

Name of the Complainant

Address

Name of the Victim

Address

Place of Incident

Date of Incident

Direction issued by the Commission

Status on 9/21/2012

Action Taken

9574

SUPERINTENDENT OF POLICE

KANNUR KERALA

KOMATH NAZAR S/O SALIM

JASEELA MANZIL, KETTINAKKAM, MUZHAPPILAGAD, (EDAKKAD POLICE STATION LIMITS)

KANNUR . KERALA THALASSERY PS KANNUR . KERALA

1/25/2010

The Commission received an intimation dated 27/1/2010 from Supdt. Of Police, Kannur, Kerala about the death of one Komath Nazar S/o Salim, aged 38 years. Jaseela Manzil, Kettinakkam, Muzhappilagad, Kannur District, Kerala on 25/1/2010 at 10.20 hrs white in the custody of Thatassery police. As per intimation the deceased, who was an accused in Thalassery PS Grime No 130/10 u/s41 (i) (a), (d) 102 Gr.P.C. hrs, committed suicide by hanging with cloth piece on the grill of the lock up door of the police station. The Commission took cognizance of the Intimation on 12/2/2010 and directed as under; - "DG (I) is requested to collect requisite reports within eight weeks. Thereafter, the case be placed before the Full Commission," The Commission also received a complaint from Shri Suhas Chakma, Director, National Campaign for Prevention of Torture, New Delhi alleging that police torture resulted in his death. The case registered vide No.29/11/2/2010-AD has been tagged with this file. Pursuant to the above directions of the Commission, Investigation Division of the Commission obtained the inquest and post mortem reports from Under Secretary, Home (SS A) Department, Govt, of Kerala vide communication dated 11/3/2010. As per inquest report, the deceased died due to banging. However, it suggested post mortem examination to ascertain the cause of death. The post mortem report indicated linear pressure abrasion on the neck below the chin. The byoid bone was intact. There is abrasion just below the tell knee. The immediate cause of death is recorded as 'died of hanging'. Viscera was preserved for chemical analysis. In his report dated 5/3/2010, the Supdt. Of Police, Kannur has stated that the case is now being investigated by the Supdt. Of Police, CB/CID, H & H Wing, Kozhikode side order dated 25/1/2010 of the Director General of Police, Kerala After perusing the record, the Commission wde-proceedings dated 12/08/2010 observed and directed as undern- "Despite sufficient time and opportunity has been given, the Magisterial Enquiry Report, viscera report and opinion about final cause of death and the CB/CID enquiry report have not been received in the Commission. The Commission conveys its displeasure to the District Magistrate, Kannur, Kerala for delay in submission of the requisite Magisterial Enquiry Report, which is a mandatory requirement as per Commission's guidelines dated 3/1/2001 in custodial death cases. Under these circumstances, let summons be issued for the personal appearance of the District Magistrate, Kannur before the Commission on 09/11/2010 along with the relevant reports. In case the reports are received on or before 02/11/2010, the personal appearance of District Magistrate, Kannur shall stand dispensed with. The Supdt, Of Police, Kannur is directed to submit the copy of the viscera report and opinion about final cause of death on the basis of chemical analysis of the viscera of the deceased within four weeks. The Supdt. Of Police, CB/CID, H & H Wing, Kozhikode, Kerala and Director General of Police, Kerala, Thiruyananthapuram are directed to submit the CB/CID enquiry report with four weeks " In response to the Summons dated 12/08/2010, Addl District Magistrate, Kannur, Kerala vide communication dated 20/09/2010 has submitted copy each of the CBCID and MER. It has further been stated opinion as to the cause of death is awaited from Police Surgeon Academy of Medical Science, Pariyaram SP, CBCID, HHW-III, Kozhikode in its report has stated that the case is under investigation. Inquest com Magisterial Enquiry was conducted by the Judicial First Class Magistrate, Thalassery. He concluded in its report as under, "On examination of witness I am of the opinion that neither local witness, ward member nor his brother has complainants against the police they are waiting for the result of postmortem report and they want an inquiry about the cause of death," During inspection of the body of the deceased. Judicial First Class Magistrate, Thalassery found ligature mark and presence of libers of cotton lunky on the neck of the deceased. The Commission has perused record. Undisputedly, the deceased was in the custody of police at the time of his death. Therefore, the police authorities were under legal obligation to protect his file and also to ensure that he may not cause self-harm white in custody. Deceased used lungi of a constable as per report, for hanging himself to death. Since, the police authorities have failed in the aforesaid duty of care to protect the life of the deceased. Government of Kerafa being the employer, is vicariously liable for the wrong done. In the lacts and circumstances narrated above, the Commission directs as under - 1) Issue notice to the Chief Secretary, Kerala to Show Cause as to why the Commission should not recommend monetary relief to the NoK of the deceased who died in the lock up as the police authorities failed in the duty of care to protect the life of the deceased within six weeks. 2) District Magistrate and Senior Superintendent of Police, Kannur and SP, CBCID, HHW-III, Kozhikode, Kerala to submit a copy each of the viscera report, final cause of death and complete report of CBCID within six weeks.

Additional Information Called for (Dated 3/17/2011)

conservate unit to the executor

Nate: For thilliber data it lendly contact National Human Rights Commission, Coparnicus Marg, New Delhi, PIN 110001 Tel.No. 23385368 Fax No. 23384863 E-Mail covidning@hub.nic.in

inclination. Until of URING to the consequent of the companion of the comp